

98/100

484

SourceURL:file://localhost/Users/guest/Documents/HST209%231.doc

McPherson Assignment

never?

I must admit that I was at first confused by this assignment. I think it mainly had to do with the fact that I have, in my entire college career, been asked to read reviews of a textbook prior to beginning a class. That being said, I find that I have a better understanding of why this particular book was chosen, and will be able to approach said textbook with the appropriate attitude. After reading the three types of reviews provided, I feel it is best to approach this book as one persons opinion of what transpired and not treat it as the absolute truth that I might have if not having read multiple other opinions.

good!

That being said, the issues related to historical accuracy that worry me the most are the fact that multiple reviewers accuse McPherson of bias. I realize that these accusations come from individuals that have read "Battle Cry of Freedom" and not the professionals hired to review the book, but in my mind this lends their opinions a little more credence. Although he goes on to praise McPherson by pointing out that his claims are "supported by extensive citations and evidence." (Thomer 2:2), Dave Thomer also touches on this possible bias, "It's hard to use a word like "balanced" to describe a book that depicts pro-slavery Southerners as the aggressors and hails Lincoln as a great leader." (Thomer 2:2). This just means that I will need to approach the subject with open eyes and hope that there will be further readings offered to round out the subject so that I may form my own opinion.

for "readability" or "historical accuracy" elements?

Even though I have stated above that the opinions offered by the general public have made me leery of accepting McPherson's opinion as fact, I still trust the author of the NY Times article the most. The reason for this is merely the fact that this author has the backing of an established and reputable company, The New York Times. I know who they are and trust that they are after presenting the truth in all things.

CAREFUL ... can't compare series

Thank you!

I still have a high level of confidence in the textbook we are using. I feel that the instructor has many great books to choose from and has an extensive amount of experience to draw from when choosing an appropriate book. The process we have just been through, reading various reviews, has actually increased my confidence in the information that will be presented in this course. The opening paragraph of the NY Times article cements this for me. "The Civil War is the most worked-over topic in United States history, one of the most written about in the history of the world." "Battle Cry of Freedom"....comprehensive yet succinct, scholarly without being pedantic, eloquent but unrhetorical." (NY Times 1:1)

Nicely done
good analysis

What a great
the Amazon.com
reviews?