

HST 202: History of the United States W14 (Escobar Meta 31101 31100)

Home ► My courses ► Winter 2014 ► HST 202 W14 (Escobar Meta 31101 31100) ► March 3 - March 9

► Forum 4 ► Chinese Now and Then

Search forums

Forum 4

Display replies in nested form Move this discussion to ...

< Previous (Native Americans and M...)

(Native Americans and M...) Next >



Chinese Now and Then

by Joe Escobar - Saturday, March 1, 2014, 10:53 PM

This forum thread is for Chinese Now and Then posts and replies.

After studying the required materials, address the questions in your posts.

To make your POSTS, click the reply link in this, MY post.

To reply to another student's post, be sure to click the reply link within in THEIR post.

IMPORTANT - SUBJECT LINES

BE SURE to use an informative subject line for your post. Do NOT simply leave it

RE: Native Chinese Now and Then

Sum of ratings: -

Edit | Delete | Reply



A diminishing of our National Power/Freedom?

by Louis Gambee - Monday, March 3, 2014, 1:51 PM

In these cartoons, one can clearly identify the anti-Chinese sentiments that circulated throughout the west during the late 19th century. With the first cartoon, it's obvious that its message relates to the common fear that many shared, in which involved the belief that the overwhelmingly large number of Chinese immigrants would continue to take the available jobs in the west. Our textbook discusses on page 614 of Chapter 18 that the Chinese were endangering "the good order of certain localities", which pretty much meant that they threatened the livelihoods of the American citizens. This notion is further supported by the second cartoon, which speaks of the fear of uncle sam (common American worker) losing his support system at the expense of the increasing numbers of immigrants.

In regards to the recent commercial, it is similar to the late 19th century sentiments expressed in these cartoons in that it speaks of the fear that our country will eventually collapse upon itself because of the way we run things, and our debt to China. The fear

back then was that the Chinese would steal our jobs, and use that to there advantage, giving them power. In this recent commercial, the message is that once again the U.S and it's people are in such a precarious situation that we eventually will be so in debt to China that it will force us to submit to their power and "work for them". The cartoons focus on one American citizens losing many of their opportunities to Chinese immigrants, whereas the commercials message intends to alert us of our country's impending loss of power, due to our increasing debt with China.

Sum of ratings:3 (1)

Show parent | Edit | Split | Delete | Reply



Re: A diminishing of our National Power/Freedom?



by Scarlett White - Monday, March 3, 2014, 10:52 PM

I agree with you when it comes to the depiction of the cartoon, even today it seems as though Americas and the America government do not like the idea of a foreign worker (although they may be more fit for the job) working in place of an American birthright citizen. Whereas in Canada, we encourage immigrants. The insecurities that America has seems to be the root of these issues, both China and America can agree with that.

Sum of ratings:1 (1)

Show parent | Edit | Split | Delete | Reply



Re: A diminishing of our National Power/Freedom?



by Kylie Stiglbauer - Sunday, March 9, 2014, 3:35 PM

I enjoyed the fact that you brought on another perspective to this forum.The fact that you can talk about Canada's ideals and views on this matter make for a much more in-depth discussion and gives us something to compare the United states to. The U.S. does a very good job of not giving foreign workers a good name in this country. While this might not be true in all instances, it is made very prevalent in majority of them(there are even movies about it). It goes to show just how much progress has been made over the years. I believe that this country has gotten much better on certain social issues, but we still have a ways to go.

Sum of ratings:1 (1)

Show parent | Edit | Split | Delete | Reply



Re: A diminishing of our National Power/Freedom?



by Spencer Phillipson - Thursday, March 6, 2014, 12:18 PM

True, the commercial and cartoons deal with two very different issues but share the common fear of the Chinese. Both the cartoons and video are reminiscent of our past and current intolerance for foreigners and the view that foreigners can be a threat to the security of our country. The commercial as well as the cartoons portray the Chinese in a very negative light which in my opinion connects with our past and present forms of racism whether they be direct or passive ways of conveying a racist idea. I think that the cartoons and video really show how history is still very alive today and problems occurring back then are not necessarily repeating but rather

connecting directly to the problems we see in our current society.

Sum of ratings:1 (1)

Show parent | Edit | Split | Delete | Reply



Re: A diminishing of our National Power/Freedom?



by Erik Long - Saturday, March 8, 2014, 10:36 PM

I agree the cartoons are obviously portraying the Chinese to be taking the jobs of the white Americans in the 19th century. The commercial is also addressing this fear of the US collapsing on itself due to the situation we are currently in with debt and the way the government is today.

In the commercial it talks about China gaining power over all other countries and beginning an empire. In regard to this I do not agree with "history repeating itself."

Sum of ratings:1 (1)

Show parent | Edit | Split | Delete | Reply



Re: A diminishing of our National Power/Freedom?



by Matt Blackshear - Saturday, March 8, 2014, 10:59 PM

Erik: What about how America used Chinese immigrants for cheap labor and then we used them for cheap products later? Cant this be an example of history repeating itself? We used them to help build our railroads which helped overproducing and overbuilding of factories, docks ect. We then eventually hit a depression in 1873. Now we have a massive debt to china from overspending again. I think history does repeat itself

Sum of ratings:1 (1)

Show parent | Edit | Split | Delete | Reply



Same passport, different stamp.



by Melissa Moser - Monday, March 3, 2014, 5:02 PM

The paranoia of the mid- to late- 1800s regarding Chinese immigrants was borne of the same mind as that regarding the Irish a decade or so earlier on the opposing coast. While the Chinese were initially recruited to immigrate as a source of cheap labor, the numbers in which they arrived (a surge of over 60,000 in 20 years, according to our text book, pg. 613) intimidated the white population of the US. However, this situation was akin to the fears towards Irishmen, freedmen, and Mexicans -- yes, they took jobs. They took jobs that most WASPs didn't want and wouldn't do for such low wages. As far as many immigrants go, the story hasn't changed to this day, although the location is a bit different. Before, white American citizens worried about immigrants coming here and taking "our" jobs. Now, American citizens are upset because we're watching American corporations take their manufacturing and general production jobs elsewhere, to countries with more lax labor regulations and citizens willing to work for pennies on the dollar. Well, or that jobs are being taken by illegal immigrants, but I find that argument a bit invalid in that they're jobs that most white Americans are either unwilling to do, or have proven to just not be as efficient in completing. I've had friends who thought it would be fun to participate in field labor in the

summers, as a character building experience. I was unaware that picking beans for something like 4 cents a pound was fun, so I suppose I have weird friends, but I digress. They found that they just could not keep up with the migrant workers in the fields beside them. While their "alien" counterparts performed veritable miracles with the crops, my friends earned, at best, a nice tan.

In the 1870s, the labor jobs being offered to the Chinese immigrants were generally undesirable. Having been put to work on the rail lines, initially, countless laborers died completing their duties (or trying). In agricultural settings, they were treated hardly different from the recently freed slaves of the South. Long hours, grueling work, minimal pay... I don't recall reading anywhere that the white protestant complainers were lining up for the jobs.

I think that's where the commercial we watched would tie in. In the commercial, we see an older man (some sort of economist?) speaking to a room full of young Chinese adults, telling them about the downfall of other powerful nations. When he begins talking about America, he says that the country tried to tax and spend its way out of debt, and that much of that debt belonged to China. He implies that, x number of years down the road (16, as of now), the Americans will all be working for China. Honestly? The vast majority of what we have and use on a regular basis in this country comes from China. We all talk about our desires to support American industry and the companies that keep jobs here, but at the end of the day, when you're broke, you buy what you can afford -- if that's the cheap version of an item from China, that's what you're getting. It is entirely possible that, at this rate, we could fall from being a world power (according to some people, we already have), but I don't think we would find ourselves in a position of indentured servitude to China. The jobs going to foreign countries are often performed in warehouses that violate a plethora of safety codes in either construction of the workspace, materials used, or treatment of workers. No one likes that fact, no one actively supports the terrible conditions or the far-flung job opportunities, but most of us passively support the practice by buying the products.

The fears of the 1870s and the fears of the 2010s are unfortunately not dissimilar in our placing the blame for situations on other races, nor in our anger over someone else taking the jobs we didn't want. I think they are different, though, in the fact that America used to fear foreign invasion of the labor market. Now, we've moved past exploiting it into flat out bringing the labor to nations with more malleable labor regulations and more favorable exchange rates. Why pay an American \$12/hr for work that someone in China, Sri Lanka, or Bangladesh will do for \$4 a day?

**I do not condone that way of thinking, but that's what I see happening with industry on the whole.

Sum of ratings: 3 (1)

[Show parent](#) | [Edit](#) | [Split](#) | [Delete](#) | [Reply](#)



Re: Chinese Now and Then



by Marcus Mcphaul - Monday, March 3, 2014, 10:25 PM

This is not a repeat of history in my opinion but more of a built up animosity in the Chinese towards Americans, and now that economic roles have reversed the Chinese can display their power over us through their media. I would see it as more of a retaliation than a repeat. Americans treated the Chinese terribly and I wouldn't expect them to just let that go

without any hard feelings it almost seems like the current propaganda is alluding to a Chinese revolution over America late in the future, and is in direct relation with the way we treated them in the in the late 1800's.

Sum of ratings:2 (1)

Show parent | Edit | Split | Delete | Reply



Re: Chinese Now and Then



by Kylie Stiglbauer - Sunday, March 9, 2014, 3:38 PM

I agree with your stance of this not being a repeat of history. As mentioned in class, history can not repeat itself, but similar events can reoccur. The point that you made about this being built up animosity is very valid. A group that goes under that kind of struggle(and overcomes it) is not going to have good relations with the people that were treating it poorly.

Sum of ratings:1 (1)

Show parent | Edit | Split | Delete | Reply



Historical and Modern Propagandas



by Linh Tran - Tuesday, March 4, 2014, 2:10 AM

The current commercial and the historical propagandas are mostly only similar to each other in their sense of anti-Chinese. However, I found it was not the “repeating of history.” In fact, it is quite different in each era’s resource of the theology of anti-Chinese. For the 1800s, American negative viewpoint of Chinese immigrants can be seen as a consequence of American nativism – similar to the society’s anti-racial prejudice toward other aliens, such as Irish. In one of the cartoons, Uncle Sam, representing the common American workers, is being swallowed up by an Irish and a Chinese on each side of his head and legs. They are both portrayed as ape-like monsters that threaten the lives of Americans. The same fear appears in the current commercial delivering the message that China wants to control the U.S. and wants Americans to work for them. Yet it is very different from what nativism had seen Chinese immigration in history, noticing that the commercial only focus on “attacking” the Chinese, not any other nations or races. It is more of the worry towards the rise of China and the reliance American economy has on it. According to the International Monetary Fund (IMF), in 2012, the United States was the world’s largest importer of foreign capital (at 37.4% of global total), while China was the largest exporter of capital (at 13.3%). From 2002 to 2012, the amount of U.S. public debt that is privately held grew from \$3.0 trillion to \$9.9 trillion; as a share of GDP, this level rose from 28.4% to 63.2%. Of the U.S. public debt that is privately held, more than half is held by foreigners. This will put the country in danger of corruption and dependence on foreign country, particularly China, if the government does not have emerged delicate economic strategies to turn around the situation. The debate still remains controversial.

Sum of ratings:3 (1)

Show parent | Edit | Split | Delete | Reply



Re: Chinese Now and Then



by Sophia Swanson - Tuesday, March 4, 2014, 8:31 AM

Between the cartoons and the YouTube video there are few connections. The first connection I see is that in the YouTube video it is apparent that the idea of the Chinese government owning the US is shown to be the main focal point. Where as in the second cartoon where Uncle Sam is appeared to be being swallowed by "foreigners" it shows once again that same idea that the US is going to be over ruled by other countries (in this case China). There is a theme of history repeating itself in the sense that we are afraid that because we are in debt that a country that has a bigger population and wealth is going to then have more control over us.

In some ways I can see how history is repeating itself. Maybe because we're growing more in debt and having to tax our way out of it, the same fear that we had hundreds of years ago is coming back into our heads. The fear that we might be loosing our power over another country. Our textbook says, "Wealthy Chinese businessmen and merchants were allowed entry because of the U.S. government's interest in trade with China. But the law forbade Chinese laborers, who were said to endanger "the good order of certain localities." (p.614)

Sum of ratings:3 (1)

[Show parent](#) | [Edit](#) | [Split](#) | [Delete](#) | [Reply](#)



Physical change

by Matt Blackshear - Tuesday, March 4, 2014, 9:47 AM

Our views on the Chinese today has definitely matured. We are not nearly as racist as we were back in the 19th century.

The difference from the Chinese now and then is somewhat physical. Back in the 19th century Americans feared that Chinese were talking over our jobs as illustrated in the first cartoon. Workingman's Party of California, and Chinese Exclusion Act were created in order to stop the chinese from taking over our jobs with their cheap labor. Now it is more so that we owe them from all of our government spending. This right here could be an example of history repeating itself. The Central Pacific used them for their cheap labor and then we used them for their cheap products.

I would also like to say (as how Joe has said in class) its to bad in the pic with Uncle Sam being eaten that the immigrants weren't on opposite sides. Seeing as how the chinese immigration was in the west and the Irish in the east.

Sum of ratings:3 (1)

[Show parent](#) | [Edit](#) | [Split](#) | [Delete](#) | [Reply](#)



History trends of the Chinese

by Spencer Phillipson - Tuesday, March 4, 2014, 12:43 PM

By viewing this more recent video and observing the cartoons I can definitely see a common trend of fear that the Chinese will eventually take over America if we do not do something about it. I view both the cartoons as well as the video as a very effective way of using propaganda to promote change within our American societies. I find the commercial and cartoons to be somewhat racist as well. The cartoons and video obviously portray the

Chinese in a negative light and show their intentions as evil as a way to provoke fear into the American population.

Sum of ratings:2 (1)

Show parent | Edit | Split | Delete | Reply



Same old same old

by Zachary Embree - Tuesday, March 4, 2014, 6:56 PM

In both the political ad and the cartoons of the 19th century we see the same thing, a fear of foreign labor and culture supplanting the current system. One of the first things that came to my mind as I was watching the ad was the trait of nativism we discussed in class, something that has clearly flared up in regards to Asian immigration both now and in the past. Speaking of the similarities of the present and 100 years ago, I found that both the cartoons and the commercial was the same message in different packages. That message was "Asian immigrants and nations are coming to take American jobs and will eventually control the economy." or something along those lines. When the economy was at its worst and the recovery period shortly after, I saw many examples of this. Endless speculation that like in the video China was going to overtake America as a world power, or like in the cartoons take all the jobs. As for a validity in these messages, I think that in my admittedly limited economic view the US barring total government collapse will dictate policy to China not the other way around. the simple fact is that both nations have much more to gain economically and politically by staying firm allies. In the end this while "anti-Chinese" mindset will fade just like the anti-Irish and blatant anti-black mindsets of the past, until a new minority is selected and history repeats itself in some fashion.

Sum of ratings:2 (1)

Show parent | Edit | Split | Delete | Reply



Re: Same old same old

by Erik Long - Saturday, March 8, 2014, 10:58 PM

I disagree. In the cartoons we looked at, yes those I think were pretty obvious that it was about Americans fearing that Chinese immigrants were going to take over the jobs in America. Today though people do not even think that Chinese are going take over the jobs.

The commercial was implying that we as the citizens of the united state support this political view that if America doesn't control the spending and the debt that we have today that this could potentially be the outcome.

Sum of ratings:1 (1)

Show parent | Edit | Split | Delete | Reply



Re: Same old same old

by Cameron Holliday - Saturday, March 8, 2014, 11:46 PM

I mean I just feel like a lot of resentment that comes from Americans comes from commercials like that. Every race has those implications but I feel as though Americans see Asians as though who will out work you. I'm not making any racist

remarks but I'm just speaking from an analytical view point of the American public.

Sum of ratings:1 (1)

Show parent | Edit | Split | Delete | Reply



Message within the Media

by Cameron Holliday - Wednesday, March 5, 2014, 5:06 PM

When it comes to industry America seems to always do the same thing. Have foreigners flow into town and work in the jobs of mass production for little to no pay. We then try to say that our country is being taken over by these foreigners and our "way of life" is threatened.

What I take from these messages in the media is that we are trying to scare our own country into believing that we will no longer be the super power and be owned and ultimately over ran by the Chinese. As time to go on whether we are the one in control or the ones asking for help we always seem to feel threatened and act as though we need regain control or else we are all doomed. The current day commercial actually had me hooked because I really wanted to know why all great nations fail but then when it turned out to be a commercial trying to strike fear into the hearts of Americans I was pretty disappointed. I just see all of these media messages as the Government scared and asking us for more money.

Sum of ratings:1 (1)

Show parent | Edit | Split | Delete | Reply



Re: Message within the Media

by Zachary Embree - Wednesday, March 5, 2014, 10:36 PM

I would not say that the commercial is really asking for money, but rather support for their political platform. But I definitely agree that the media has been for years saying that the collapse of Americas influence is imminent, or that there is some dire threat about foreign control over the country. Very rarely is any of the news I hear from various cable networks unbiased or with the proper context. I imagine most of this is coming from the fact that that kind of news sells, but personally I think we as a country have a "us against them" mentality. That might explain also why we have a military force capable of ending life as we know it.

Sum of ratings:1 (1)

Show parent | Edit | Split | Delete | Reply



Re: Message within the Media

by Melissa Moser - Saturday, March 8, 2014, 4:38 PM

I completely agree that it seems to be nothing more than politically-based media intimidation. While there is a similarity between the political cartoons and the commercial in that they are based on the Chinese and our fear of them (largely economically-based), I think all of them are largely depictions of America's whining about what we did to ourselves. We do, indeed, have a long history of recruiting cheap labor and then complaining about those who do it.

I find the media examples we were given, especially the commercial, to have the same intended effect as the factory owner we learned about in class -- he hired one Chinese man to enter and exit his factory so that his workers would think more were coming and would be more productive so as to keep their jobs. These cartoons and commercials seem mostly like generational scare tactics to keep the public and elected officials "in line".

Sum of ratings:2 (1)

[Show parent](#) | [Edit](#) | [Split](#) | [Delete](#) | [Reply](#)



Re: Chinese Now and Then



by Joe Hoover - Saturday, March 8, 2014, 8:19 PM

The commercial is all about China taking over our country and that I think is what Americans thought when they were drawing these political cartoons. I think picture is about the Chinese being able to do every job at once and then the white people are standing outside because the Chinese can will produce more and work harder. The second picture is showing the same thing with the Irish immigrant taking control as well as the Chinese. The third is clearly showing that the Chinese are trying to come into our country by the thousands that we need to keep them out of our country.

Sum of ratings:1 (1)

[Show parent](#) | [Edit](#) | [Split](#) | [Delete](#) | [Reply](#)



Chinese Up Until Now..



by Scarlett White - Saturday, March 8, 2014, 11:23 PM

In the commercial the man describes why the United States would ultimately fail, and also states the true fact of the United States owing most of its money to China. Then at the end of the commercial is promotes "stopping the spending that is bankrupting America." In my opinion, this film is using a combination of the past and current fears that Americans have of the Chinese. I do not necessarily think that it is "history repeating itself" but I do believe that the sentiments that the Americans withheld in the past are still present today. The United States lives in constant fear, not only because of the debt that has been acquired but also because of the way the Chinese are presented in the political cartoons from the past. The first political cartoon, for example, shows a Chinese man performing multiple tasks at once while Americans stand around with nothing to do. This is because the Chinese have taken the jobs from the Americans. With fear comes resentment, and even to this day, there are stereotypes that could and do affect employment for Americans. Furthermore, the second cartoon is a lot like the video, there is that fear of "Uncle Sam" being swallowed by foreigners which is essentially what the entire commercial is about. When it comes down to it, history cannot repeat itself if the issues have not subsided. It is simply just a continuation.

Sum of ratings:3 (1)

[Show parent](#) | [Edit](#) | [Split](#) | [Delete](#) | [Reply](#)



Re: Chinese Up Until Now..



by Spencer Phillipson - Sunday, March 9, 2014, 9:52 PM

I agree, it seems that the United States continues to use propaganda in order to instill fear into the American population. The Chinese were said to have threatened our jobs back then and yet today immigrants from Mexico and other parts of South America are being restricted from entering our country. We seem to have a conservative way of looking at things when it comes to issues on racial limitations, always looking at keeping things how they are rather than opening opportunities that could potentially put our government and way of life at risk. The commercial is used as a tactic to stop heavy spending to conserve the way things are and remain one of the worlds super powers. The commercial brings up very valid points but seems to put the Chinese in a very negative light. It tricks the viewer into thinking the Chinese are evil and portrays them as if they are an enemy. This concept is very similar to the cartoons and can be seen as racist in certain perspectives.

Sum of ratings:1 (1)

[Show parent](#) | [Edit](#) | [Split](#) | [Delete](#) | [Reply](#)



Re: Chinese Now and Then

by Marcus Mcphaul - Sunday, March 9, 2014, 4:32 PM

The first cartoon shows a Chinese man performing multiple tasks at once while the Americans who refuse to work for such a low wage. This commercial was made over 100 years ago, but it still highlights some key situations America is faced with today. The biggest is that this is almost exactly how American based companies such as Nike earn such great income off of their clothes, but instead of the Chinese coming to America we are outsourcing jobs to them. I would not call this a repeat in history but more of a business tactic from American business owners trying to find the cheapest possible way to create their products, in order to receive the absolute most profits possible, but it still effects our country economically the same way it did then by taking jobs away from American citizens.

Sum of ratings:1 (1)

[Show parent](#) | [Edit](#) | [Split](#) | [Delete](#) | [Reply](#)

[< Previous \(Native Americans and M...\)](#)

[\(Native Americans and M...\) Next >](#)

You are logged in as Joe Escobar (Logout)

[Moodle Docs for this page](#)

