

HST 201: History of United States F18 (Escobar Meta 20749 22611)

[Home](#) / [My courses](#) / [HST 201 F18 \(Escobar Meta 20749 22611\)](#) / [Week 3](#) / [Forum 1](#)
/ [Puritanism & Islam](#)



Search forums

Forum 1 Puritanism & Islam



[Subscribe](#)

◀ [Puritanism & Islam](#)

Display replies in nested form



Move this discussion to ...



Move

Pin



Puritanism & Islam

by [Joe Escobar](#) - Friday, October 5, 2018, 10:35 AM

This thread is for discussions on the Puritanism & Islam topic.

To make your POSTS, click the reply link in this, MY post. To reply to another student's post, be sure to click the reply link within in THEIR post.

IMPORTANT - SUBJECT LINES

BE SURE to use an informative subject line for your post, something that describes which one of the questions you are addressing. Do NOT simply leave it RE: Puritanism & Islam

Sum of ratings: -

[Permalink](#) | [Edit](#) | [Delete](#) | [Reply](#)



Religion can't really be removed from its influence on governmental decisions.

by [Fallon King](#) - Saturday, October 6, 2018, 9:02 PM

Although the discovery that the students at Notre Dame voted against polygamy, thus essentially voting against religious freedom is concerning, I am not at all shocked. The education system in America is not as functional as it should be. The results of the religion poll partially affect my viewpoint on certain subjects- especially religion based. As a Christian, I do believe that sharing God's word and reaching new groups of people is

important. As said in the podcast, “Puritanism offered a totalizing, undifferentiated worldview” (Audio 3: 48-minute mark). With that being said, I do believe that I have a bias towards this particular argument. I do not believe that religion and its influence on governmental decisions should be removed. Within the supreme court, there are three individuals that practice Judaism, five Catholics, and one Protestant. Even if we put Atheists or Agnostics in office they will obviously rule decisions differently, but religion is a main component on our nation's beginning. Thus, you can not fully get rid of religion in government, and still, expect it to remain completely functional.

Sum of ratings:3 (1) 3

[Permalink](#) | [Show parent](#) | [Edit](#) | [Split](#) | [Delete](#) | [Reply](#)



Religion and Government

by [Owen McCoy](#) - Monday, October 8, 2018, 2:58 PM

I was very surprised by the findings that were mentioned in the interview. Puritanism is most closely related to Protestant Christianity, and as was pointed out in class, the population of the United States consists of more Protestants than anything else. What the interview mentioned is that the Egyptian students were specifically able to understand the Puritans' interweaving of church and state. Perhaps one factor here is that the United States has no official religion is has a constitution based on the separation of church and state whereas Egypt has an official religion of Islam. One of the reasons behind the Puritan settlement of North America was to build an ideal Christian state, and Egypt is an Islamic state. As was mentioned in class, religious teachings tell you to live out your religion to the fullest, so your religion should come into play if you are making decisions in the government. However, the U.S. guarantees religious freedom so there is a line between promoting ideals of your religion through government and imposing on other people's freedoms, and that line is currently being debated over in prominent issues today.

Sum of ratings:2 (1) 2

[Permalink](#) | [Show parent](#) | [Edit](#) | [Split](#) | [Delete](#) | [Reply](#)



Re: Puritanism & Islam, understanding the views of different societies.

by [Hunter Ignatius](#) - Monday, October 8, 2018, 9:44 PM

I am not extremely thrown off by this discovery. While I am surprised that the Islamic youth did in fact side more-so with the puritans, I felt as though I also need to remember that the normal social attributes of a foreign society would change dramatically depending on the widely accepted “Normal” Religion of the Area. Based off of the social standards that some religions apply to the normal parts of everyday life, such as formal dress ware. It is understandable though that the colonizers pre-declaration of independence, would want a more singular, purist religion to help with maintaining any conflict that could occur because of religious difference. However it is surprising that with a case that was voted upon after the declaration of independence was written, which granted religious freedom, voted against religious freedom.

Sum of ratings:1 (1) 1

[Permalink](#) | [Show parent](#) | [Edit](#) | [Split](#) | [Delete](#) | [Reply](#)

**Effects of religion on decisions**by [Owen McCoy](#) - Wednesday, October 10, 2018, 2:38 PM

It is interesting that the American students voted against religious freedom while the Egyptian students voted for religious freedom. However, it could have to do with the specific issue at hand. Notre Dame is a Catholic school, and the Catholic church teachings don't allow polygamy. On the other hand, Egypt is an Islamic state. I don't know if Egypt is included in this, but I know that some Islamic states still practice polygamy to this day. It would be interesting to repeat this experiment with a different issue, something that Islam prohibits but Catholicism allows. My point is, this could have more to do with religion than interpretation of the constitution.

Sum of ratings: **1 (1)**

1

[Permalink](#) | [Show parent](#) | [Edit](#) | [Split](#) | [Delete](#) | [Reply](#)**Why is it that other students can apply our constitution to their mock trial better than we can in real life?**by [Maggie Larson](#) - Monday, October 8, 2018, 10:45 PM

Count me in on the "eyes glazed over" group. It is not so much that my eyes are glazed over, more like my entire self is and I am swimming in different thoughts. Our nation is so divided right now and I have been very immersed this past week in the appointment of our new Supreme Court Justice. What strikes me the most is that this great divide truly seems to be driven largely by the conservative religious people in our country versus people who can still honor their faith in god, or whomever they believe in, while accepting at the same time that we are a diverse group of people. That we as people all have value and can contribute to humanity.

Rather than appreciating human diversity and practicing acceptance the religious conservatives seem to constantly push their beliefs as how we should all live our lives. While I certainly respect what the Puritans were trying to accomplish when they came to the new land, they seemed to ultimately turn around and repeat what they were trying to change. I believe history repeats itself in different ways. The part of the constitution that stands out to me vividly is for separation of church and state. That piece was such a crucial part of the country our forefathers were trying to create for us and yet we seem to be fighting for that principal now more than ever.

The podcast regarding the Mason essay was fascinating. It is not surprising to me that the students in Cairo came to the conclusion that they did about polygamy. They based their decision on the ruling by actually following the guidelines of our constitution and it's guarantee of religious freedom. They did not let themselves get distracted by their own religious ideals and beliefs. They were attentive to the need for separation of church and state. Why is it in this country that we can't even manage to do that for ourselves?

Maggie Larson

[Permalink](#) | [Show parent](#) | [Edit](#) | [Split](#) | [Delete](#) | [Reply](#)

Sum of ratings: 1 (1) 1

**Re: Why is it that other students can apply our constitution to their mock trial better than we can in real life?**by [Christopher Bischoff](#) - Saturday, October 13, 2018, 5:42 PM

Sometimes it seems like the Nation is very divided on the media, yet I find that Americans actually have a lot in common. Even between Democrats and Republicans. I think that part of what makes this country truly great is the diversity we have here. It is truly remarkable to travel around the US and see the different types of American culture unique to each state. As we learned from the Massasoit and the Pilgrims, diversity is not easy and it can make people nervous and uncomfortable. Back then it led to warfare between the Wampanoag and the Settlers, fighting was a result of differences "over borders and proper ways of using the land." (pg 81). Just one among many conflicts of that time period. Today, we have very similar disputes, but very different ways of finding the solution. I think that conflict is inevitable when there is diversity within a population. The characteristic that makes groups, or societies truly great is when they can discuss issues or disagreements with civility and respect.

The section in your post that interested me was "The part of the constitution that stands out to me vividly is for separation of church and state." The reason it stuck out to me was because I am unaware of which part of the constitution you are talking about. I read through the constitution trying to find the separation of church and state but could not find it. The closest thing I found was the First Amendment to the Constitution, which states "Congress shall make no law respecting an establishment of religion, or prohibiting the free exercise thereof; or abridging the freedom of speech, or of the press; or the right of the people peaceably to assemble, and to petition the government for a redress of grievances."

It seems to me that the government cannot favor a certain religion over another, or prohibit the exercise of religion. It's similar to a paradox. People living within the States have religious beliefs, and they probably also want what is best for their region or state. So if they run for office, they cannot be denied because that would be religious discrimination. And if they do get into office then it is almost inevitable that their upbringing or belief system will in some way influence their morality and therefore law-making decisions. Unless there is a complete ban on religion, there can never truly be a separation of church and state.

Another part that interested me in your post was when you talked about the students in Cairo, and their view on polygamy and how they "based their decision on the ruling by actually following the guidelines of our constitution and its guarantee of religious freedom." To allow Mormons to practice polygamy. While they did follow the guidelines of our constitution, I fail to see how "They were attentive to the need for separation of church and state." Because they are quite clearly influenced by their own religion and tradition of polygamy. I think that it proves the point that in a society that practices religion, there can be no separation of church and state. Religion will always influence those in power.

<https://billofrightsinstitute.org/wp-content/uploads/2012/04/Constitution.pdf>

https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Reynolds_v._United_States

Sum of ratings:3 (1)

3



[Permalink](#) | [Show parent](#) | [Edit](#) | [Split](#) | [Delete](#) | [Reply](#)



Religion removed from government

by [Sharon Osicho](#) - Monday, October 8, 2018, 11:48 PM

I do not believe religion can be removed from today's government simply because it has been included for a long time. However, I do believe that one's religion or lack of should not be the main factor in deciding issues that effect people's lives.

Sum of ratings:0 (1)

0



[Permalink](#) | [Show parent](#) | [Edit](#) | [Split](#) | [Delete](#) | [Reply](#)



Re: Puritanism & Islam

by [Ben Crawford](#) - Thursday, October 11, 2018, 10:58 PM

Before reading the articles and listening to the podcasts, I was not aware of how many things in modern society that the puritans influenced. One such thing is its basis on educational importance. As an American, school is something that everyone does and it essentially a universal right. However if you go take a look at other countries, many of them don't require a basic education and you can see kids running around in the streets all day. That's something I feel like alot of us take for granted because of its normality. In "Introduction: The Puritans" it shows that perhaps the most important groundwork they laid was that of "base government on the principle of contract or covenant" which obviously translates to our Constitution and Bill of Rights. Both of these documents could

be said to be the most important part of why America is America. Of course many of the beliefs held by 17th century puritans were different than those of the founding fathers, but they had the still had some of the same core values. Overall, I was pretty shocked to find out what an influence they had in the building of our country and how if they never settled in Massachusetts Bay, we might not be here today.

Sum of ratings:2 (1)

2

[Permalink](#) | [Show parent](#) | [Edit](#) | [Split](#) | [Delete](#) | [Reply](#)**Are your eyes glazed over?**by [Justin Oljace](#) - Friday, October 12, 2018, 9:41 PM

In the audio professor Patrick Mason talks about his experience with Egyptian students where they were able to grasp information about the English Puritans better than American students. I'm concerned with this finding because I think people should know the history of their country. I feel like I understand the Puritans and their influence. I think a similarity between the two different kinds of students is both being ashamed at how the Native Americans had land taken away from them, slavery, and war that came in the New World. In the textbook it says, "The expansion stemmed not only from religious idealism, but also from a need for more land to accommodate a steady stream of transatlantic migration"(66). The Puritans went on to launch a war against the Pequots killing 400 people, with many wars to follow. I would say that some differences between the students would be that the "eyes glaze over" students might not have any interest in American history or simply aren't religious and ignore it. I think students in this country deserve to be properly taught the importance Puritans had on the founding of the United States.

Sum of ratings:2 (1)

2

[Permalink](#) | [Show parent](#) | [Edit](#) | [Split](#) | [Delete](#) | [Reply](#)**Impact of religion in the modern day**by [Christopher Bischoff](#) - Saturday, October 13, 2018, 12:27 PM

I am not surprised that Mr. Caster finds that his students from Cairo have a better understanding of the worldview of the Puritans during settlement. The Puritans lives revolved around the Bible, which is very similar to the way devout Muslims live. Both of their worlds are dominated by their religion, and both religions have various sects and divisions that developed over time.

It is hard for me to relate to the Puritans in early America. I can imagine, but the way I have lived is vastly different from the way they lived. The only way I can relate to the Puritans in early America is through my grandparents who are Quaker. The little understanding or religion and Quakerism is through them. I have visited them in Philadelphia and there are still many practicing Quakers over there. The impact that early Quakers have had in the part of the world is clear to me. So it is not hard for me to imagine how Protestants have influenced modern day America.

According to (<http://www.pewresearch.org/fact-tank/2016/11/14/if-the-u-s-had-100-people-charting-americans-religious-affiliations/>) a majority of Americans are Protestant, followed by Catholics. Which is similar to our class demographic. What I find interesting is that most people that claim to be religious, are far more tolerant than their religious counter-parts of the past. I think it is because of the way we are raised in the modern world. We live in a more diverse world that is dependent on global commerce. We are taught whilst growing up to get along with others, no matter how they look like. I imagine this is far different from the way children in the 1600's were raised. I wonder why people identify with certain religions? and how does that affect their day to day life?

I identify as a Quaker because I was raised in a Quaker household, and I agree with most of the ideals that Quakers have. The biggest one of which is to look for the good in a person. My parents never pushed religion on me growing up, and I had little interest in it. Although now that I am a little older, and have some life experience, I enjoy the community and guidance religion has to offer. I don't attend meetings regularly. I don't even go out of my way to follow Quaker ideals but I find that the way I was raised by my Quaker mother, who was raised by my Quaker Grandparents, has more influence on my behavior than I realize.

Sum of ratings:3 (1)

3



[Permalink](#) | [Show parent](#) | [Edit](#) | [Split](#) | [Delete](#) | [Reply](#)



Re: Religion in governmental decisions

by [Gurpritam Sandhar](#) - Saturday, October 13, 2018, 7:51 PM

No matter how hard one tries, religion cannot be removed from the influence it has on governmental decisions. People who believe in a higher power will always be biased when it comes to making decisions. In our book, on page 47 under the section "The English Reformation", Murrin, talks about Henry VIII. He writes," Desperate for a male heir, had broken with the pope to divorce his queen...he proclaimed himself the "Only Supreme Head" of the church of England." If we take Henry and use him as an example, he pretty much was the government since he had proclaimed himself as the "only supreme head" and every decision he made was because of religion and faith even if it wasn't for the benefit of the people. Today, I feel like people who have a religion and believe in a higher power think twice before making any decision big or small, which in my opinion is a good thing.

How do you guys feel about it?

Sum of ratings:1 (1)

1



[Permalink](#) | [Show parent](#) | [Edit](#) | [Split](#) | [Delete](#) | [Reply](#)



Re: Religion in governmental decisions

by [Owen McCoy](#) - Saturday, October 13, 2018, 10:31 PM

I would certainly like to think that devoutly religious people in the government are more conscious about their decisions. Henry VIII is an extreme example of the use of religion to serve one's purposes, whereas today I think that people generally have good

intentions.

You mentioned your opinion that religion can't be removed from government. I am inclined to share this opinion, but I also have to wonder if a lack of religion has to same effect on decisions. (For example, an atheist on the supreme court might rule in support of gay marriage because they are not bound by the church's teachings.) Would a lack of a religion lead to a bias *against* religion or would it just lead to true impartiality?

Sum of ratings:1 (1)

1



[Permalink](#) | [Show parent](#) | [Edit](#) | [Split](#) | [Delete](#) | [Reply](#)



Should religion be removed in government decisions?

by [Justin Oljace](#) - Saturday, October 13, 2018, 10:57 PM

I don't think religion can really be "removed" from government decisions. In the first paragraph of the "Introduction: The Puritan" article it says, "Any inventory of the elements that have gone into the making of the "American mind" would have to commence with Puritanism." So is a little Puritanism in all of us? Everyone grows up with different backgrounds which means we all have different morals. These morals affect are everyday decisions. Like how the Puritans made the decisions to leave England and come to America based on their religious beliefs, morals, and the need for a fresh start. In class Joe talked about how England went through a crazy period where the countries religion bounced back and forth based on the current king or queen. I'm pretty sure Henry VIII didn't "remove" religion from government decisions when he turned England into a Protestant country and killed 57,000 Catholics. The same goes for Edward VI, Mary I, and Queen Elizabeth. The point is people aren't able to remove their religion and beliefs when they are elected into a government position.

Another question is should Religion be removed from government decisions? I've really thought about this question and have struggled to come up with an answer. One reason for yes totally remove it could be that Religion is old and doesn't fit well in today's society. A reason for no is that Christianity had a lot to do with the founding of this country's laws and constitution. I believe the answer to this question is the government should try to leave religion out of decisions to the best of their ability but it will never be totally removed because we are only human.

Sum of ratings:2 (1)

2



[Permalink](#) | [Show parent](#) | [Edit](#) | [Split](#) | [Delete](#) | [Reply](#)



Puritanism & Islam - What Americans should know...

by [Maggie Larson](#) - Saturday, October 13, 2018, 11:54 PM

A well educated American student would know the Puritans had the greatest of intentions. They felt a strong desire for change in the Church of England to such a degree that they were willing to risk their lives by bringing everything they could to a whole new land and in an effort to improve their church and government. It was the Puritans who created the idea of a government, that was "for the people by the people." The whole reason our country

was established in the first place was because there were people who could envision a better life for them and their families. The Puritans were people willing to travel to a foreign land and work hard to live the life they knew could exist. They set sail for the american dream before the american dream even existed. Educated Americans should know these everlasting influences on our country by the Puritans today because of the impact they've left.

Sum of ratings: 1 (1)

1

[Permalink](#) | [Show parent](#) | [Edit](#) | [Split](#) | [Delete](#) | [Reply](#)[◀ Puritanism & Islam](#)[◀ Chapter 3 Quiz \(hidden\)](#)

Jump to...

[CLICK HERE for Forum 1 Materials & Questions \(hidden\) ▶](#)[i Moodle Docs for this page](#)You are logged in as [Joe Escobar](#) ([Log out](#))[HST 201 F18 \(Escobar Meta 20749 22611\)](#)

? GET HELP

[SHED \(Student Help Desk\)](#)[ATC \(Instructor Help Desk\)](#)[How to use Moodle \(Basics for Students\)](#)[IT Services](#)[Computer Labs](#)[Tutoring Services](#)[Library](#)[Get the mobile app](#)